



## MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

February 7, 2023

Members Present: Tim Fenwick, Chair  
Kyle Herman, Vice-Chair  
Gary Spring

Members Absent: None

Also Present: Debra Bennington, Civil Service Clerk  
John Pribonic, Mayor  
Jaime Syx, Law Director  
Jeffrey Film, Police Chief  
Mark Stone, Fire Chief  
Mike Lang, Assistant Fire Chief

### I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Fenwick called the regular Civil Service Commission meeting of February 7, 2023 to order at 8:05 a.m. Mayor Pribonic swore in new members Gary Spring and Kyle Herman and welcomed them to the Commission. Ms. Bennington called the roll.

### II. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Motion:

Mr. Spring moved and Mr. Herman seconded to elect Tim Fenwick as Chair.  
Mr. Fenwick moved and Mr. Spring seconded to elect Kyle Herman as Vice Chair.

Yes, Votes: Fenwick, Herman, Spring  
No Votes: None. The motion carried.

### III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion:

Mr. Fenwick moved and Mr. Herman seconded to approve the minutes of May 26, 2022 as submitted.

Yes, Votes: Fenwick, Herman, Spring  
No Votes: None. The motion carried.

IV. OLD BUSINESS

None.

V. NEW BUSINESSA. POLICE OFFICER ENTRANCE EXAMINATION

Chief Film reported six (6) candidates remain on our eligibility list. There is only one person we are looking at and she is being interviewed today to see if she is still interested in the position. Chief Film requested a new test be held in May or August, and he would like to use National Testing Network (NTN) for on-line testing. It worked out very well for our last test. There are two (2) retirements scheduled for February 2024 and a lieutenant retiring in June 2023. Chief Film stated he would like to exercise the option of doing a lateral transfer for the current hire should this candidate not wish to continue in the process. In February 2021, lateral transfer was added to our Civil Service Rules, but a valid list cannot be in place to use it. He thought it might be best to terminate the current list and use lateral transfer to fill Lieutenant Titus' position up to the point there is a new test given and an eligibility list in place.

Motion:

Mr. Fenwick moved and Mr. Herman seconded to terminate the current eligibility list effective March 1, 2023 and send out RFP's for an examination in August 2023.

Yes Votes: Fenwick, Herman, Spring

No Votes: None. The motion carried.

Chief Film stated he would also like permission to do a lateral transfer window from March 1, 2023 to the date of exam. Mr. Spring asked how someone would get on the transfer list; Chief Film replied we would post it. Chief Film clarified that the lateral transfer list would only apply to entry-level police officers.

Motion:

Mr. Fenwick moved and Mr. Spring seconded to allow an appointment off the lateral transfer list between March 1, 2023 and when an eligibility list is certified from the August testing at the entry-level position to fill the vacancy created by Lieutenant Titus.

Yes Votes: Fenwick, Herman, Spring

No Votes: None. The motion carried.

B. FIREFIGHTER ENTRANCE EXAMINATION

Chief Stone stated he would like to give a test as soon as possible because there are a couple of retirements coming up this year and we will need to fill those vacancies. We have interviewed everyone in Band A on the eligibility list, but we are not considering any of those candidates for hire at this time. Some candidates may/may not have their paramedic certification and some are too young.

Chief Stone stated he would like to combine the current list with a new test. One reason is that we require candidates to be a paramedic. As candidates are constantly going through paramedic school, this would give us a fresh list with new candidates that we could consider for hiring. Last year, we used NTN for on-line testing with success.

Mr. Spring stated the Commission received a letter from candidate Joseph McVey (a copy of which is attached to the original minutes) and asked Chief Stone to respond. Chief Stone stated Mr. McVey has spoken to the Service Director, Mayor and Assistant Fire Chief. No other candidates have had that opportunity to speak internally to City staff. Mr. McVey also requested to speak to him [Chief Stone]; however, he would not do so because it would be unfair to other candidates. Mr. McVey has been vetted, considered, and is still active on our list. That is where he stands. We do not send letters to people with a thumbs up or thumbs down, we hire people off the list and those who remain on our list, remain on our list. He has not been treated any differently than any other candidate other than he has had access to people within the City that other candidates have not.

Mr. Spring asked if we gave a new test, would Mr. McVey remain on the list because the two lists would merge. Chief Stone replied that Mr. McVey tested in 2021, and that test was combined with the 2022 test. Mr. Fenwick commented we could give a test in May 2023 and have it expire after one (1) year so that both tests expire in May of 2024. Chief Stone replied his concern on waiting until May is that there are many fire departments testing this spring. Getting our candidates hired takes a long time. We are actually going to have a vacancy and we are hoping to get candidates hired ahead of needing to use overtime. Mr. Fenwick suggested testing in April 2023, certifying the list in May 2023, and having the list expire in May 2024. That would be fair to everyone and give us a good-sized list. He believed that addressed Mr. McVey's concern because he will remain on the eligibility list.

Ms. Bennington asked if candidates could retest if they wanted to try for a better score; Mr. Fenwick replied yes. Mr. Spring asked what the cost was for the previous test. Ms. Bennington responded the City paid \$2,450.00 to PoliceApp for the candidate's application fee, \$750.00 to NTN for an annual membership fee, and \$508.78 for newspaper advertising. Candidates paid NTN's testing fee of \$55.00 or the reduced cost of \$12.00 to transfer their score, if previously tested.

Chief Stone stated we went to electronic applications and on-line testing last year and it worked out very well. The advantage was candidates from across the country were able to take the test and there was a three (3) week window to complete the test. Mr. Spring asked if many out-of-state candidates were not willing to travel when called for an interview; Chief Stone replied we only had a few candidates from out-of-state and they did travel here. We still tend to draw mainly local people so we are competing against our neighbors for qualified candidates. It is very competitive because there are so few candidates available compared to twenty (20) years ago. Mr. Spring asked if our wages are competitive; Chief Stone replied yes.

Motion:

Mr. Fenwick moved and Mr. Spring seconded to send out RFP's with the ultimate goal of testing in March of 2023, certify that list at the appropriate time, and the candidates on the current eligibility list that expires in May 2024 will remain eligible and have the option of retesting and using their best score.

Yes Votes: Fenwick, Herman, Spring  
 No Votes: None. The motion carried.

C. LAW DEPARTMENT TRAINING

Ms. Syx provided training on public records, Open Meetings Act, and conflicts of interest. A discussion ensued regarding the passing of an ordinance requiring Boards & Commissions to meet in Council Chambers to record and live stream their meetings on YouTube. Ms. Syx requested the Commission take a formal vote on whether they would like to keep their meetings the same or if they would like to follow the legislation.

Motion:

Mr. Fenwick moved and Mr. Herman seconded to keep the meeting procedures the same as they currently are with the understanding that the Commission can change their mind later.

Yes Votes: Fenwick, Herman, Spring  
 No Votes: None. The motion carried.

VI. NEXT MEETING

A special meeting is scheduled for February 28, 2023 at 8:00 a.m. to review proposals received for entry-level Police Officer and Firefighter testing.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:51 a.m.

---

Tim Fenwick  
 Chair, Civil Service Commission

---

Debra Bennington  
 Civil Service Clerk

db

\\ccss\Common\Service\BENNINGTON\Civil Service\Commission Meetings\2023\Minutes\02-07-23 Minutes.doc